

Hints for Criteria Writing and Using Criteria (Steps 4 and 5)

Here are a few helpful hints for writing strong, well-focused criteria and for ranking your 10 best solutions.

- ◆ When writing criteria, always keep in mind that strong criteria will give you a strong, empowering best solution. Weak, “wishy-washy” criteria will give you a weak, wishy-washy best solution.
- ◆ Target criteria are much better than stock criteria, if you can come up with them! (Target criteria target the UP, while stock criteria are those that can be used in any scenario or topic). Target criteria are worth 2 points, while stock are only worth 1 point. They also help you to come up with a strong best solution.
- ◆ You can get two target criteria straight off from your UP – one from the KVP and one from the purpose. For example imagine that a UP for a topic on Computer Error:
 - Because the resources of towns and cities in Australia are being stretched by the sudden population increases resulting from Aida’s recommendations, HMW assist these towns to cope with the huge population increase so that people are able to live comfortably there in 2015 and beyond?
- Two possible target criteria that you could get from this UP are:
 - Which solution best assists Australian towns and cities to cope with the huge population increases?
 - Which solution best enables people to live comfortably?
- ◆ You then go on to think of three other criteria which also target the UP, for example:
 - Which solution best uses resources already available in these towns and cities?
 - Which solution is the most acceptable to the towns’ and cities’ local governments?
 - Which solution provides the most efficient use of existing amenities?
- ◆ Using these criteria will give you a really empowering best solution, which will actively solve the UP. Using stock criteria, such as:
 - Which solution is the most cost efficient?
 - Which solution is the quickest to put in place?
 - Which solution is the most acceptable?
 - Which solution uses the resources best?
 - Which solution is the easiest to put in place?

means that the best solution that these will give you will probably give you a weaker solution that doesn’t really empower people.

- ◆ **Never ever use “Which solution best solves the UP” as a criterion.** This is the whole purpose of using criteria!
- ◆ Once you have chosen your five criteria, you then choose your 8 best solutions from Step 3. Put their numbers into the box under your criteria, and a 3 – 5 word summary of what is in that solution. This will help you to remember which solution is which.
- ◆ Now you can start ranking! Look at the first criterion that you wrote, and then at the 8 solutions. Give the solution that best achieves that criterion 8 marks, the next best 7 marks and the third best 6 marks. Now look at the worst achieving solution, and give it 1 mark for that criterion, the next worse 2 marks and the next worse 3 marks. Don't agonise too much over which solutions should get 4 and 5 – scatter them in.
- ◆ Now move on to the next criterion, and go through the same process as before with the ranking scores. Do this with each of the 5 criteria, then add across each line for each solution. The solution with the highest score is your best solution. If you get a tie for best solution, look at the two and change a couple of rankings.
- ◆ An acceptable grid would look like this:

Solution	1	2	3	4	5	Total
10 Floating cities	7	6	8	6	4	31
4 Recreation Centres	1	1	2	4	2	10
19 Auto walkways	3	3	6	5	3	20
1 Second city outside	6	7	5	2	8	28
13 Shuttle cars	2	4	1	1	6	14
9 Hover freeways	4	2	3	3	7	19
2 Housing towers	8	8	4	7	5	32
12 Send people back	5	5	7	8	1	26

I hope that this has been of some help in explaining this to you.

Kia kaha and good luck in the next problem.

– Christine Sangster, National Evaluation Director